Femine Values in Management: A Research on BIST 100 Companies in Turkey

Örgüt Yönetimlerinde Kadınsı Değerler: Türkiye'deki BİST 100 Şirketleri Üzerine Bir Araştırma

Nurcan AKBAŞ[1] Bahar TANER[2]

Abstract

Feminine values in management are investigated in this article. The main purpose of article is to define a management framework through examining the expectations and views of leading Turkish business executives about ideal management. The similarities and connection of this management framework with feminine values is searched in order to gain an important perspective to the practice of management. In the research, the phenomenology as a qualitative research method and the document and interview method as the data collection technique were used. After the review of literature on management and leadership, the leadership behaviors and values adopted by executives of the leading companies were investigated on the basis of the data obtained from the interviews. Content analyses were carried out on the vision, mission and values statements of the companies in their websites. The results show that feminine values are predominant in effective management, feminine leadership behaviors are preferred, effective management values change over time, and preferences for success and happiness exhibit a concentration in feminine values. The findings of the study also revealed the importance of feminine values in all management practices in order to gain efficiency in management such as strategy determination, training, merit rating in performance evaluation and coordination. In this context, some recommendations are made.

Key words: Management, Feminine values, Masculine values, Leadership behaviors.

Paper Type: Research

Öz

Bu makalede örgüt yönetiminde kadınsı değerler araştırılmıştır. Makalenin temel amacı, önde gelen Türk şirket yöneticilerinin ideal yönetime ilişkin beklenti ve görüşlerini incelemek, bu noktadan hareketle bir yönetim çerçevesi tanımlamak, bu tanımın kadınsı değerlerle olan benzerlik ve ilişkilerini yorumlamak ve böylelikle yönetime önemli bir bakış açısı kazandırmaktır. Araştırmada nitel araştırma yöntemi olarak olgu bilim ve veri toplama tekniği olarak belge ve görüşme yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Öncelikle yönetim ve liderlikle ilgili literatürdeki değer ve davranış biçimleri incelenmiş ve Türkiye'nin önde gelen şirket yöneticilerinin hangi liderlik davranışlarını ve değerlerini benimsedikleri araştırılmıştır. Bu kapsamda Türkiye İMKB'de en yüksek performansa sahip ilk 100 şirket analiz alanı olarak seçilerek işletmelerin web sitelerinde vizyon, misyon ve değer tanımları ve yöneticilerden elde edilen veriler üzerinden içerik analizi yapılmıştır. Sonuçlar, etkili yönetimde kadınsı değerlerin ağırlıkta olduğunu, kadınsı liderlik davranışlarının tercih edildiğini, etkili yönetim değerlerinin zamanla değiştiğini ve başarı ve mutluluk tercihlerinde kadınsı değerlere yoğunlaşıldığını göstermektedir. Çalışmanın bulguları, örgütlerin yönetiminde strateji belirleme, eğitim, performans değerlendirmede liyakati öne çıkarma ve

---

[1] Dr , Mersin Üniversitesi/ Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, nurcanakbas07@hotmail.com, ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6871-6449.

[2] Prof. Dr. , Mersin Üniversitesi/ Tourism Faculty, bahartaner@mersin.edu.tr, ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4169-6716

koordinasyon dahil tüm yönetim uygulamalarında kadınsı değerlerin önemini ortaya koymuştur. Bu bağlamda, kadına yönelik pozitif ayrımcılığın bir organizasyon ve devlet politikası olarak uygulanması ve bu uygulamaların

hukuken güvence altına alınması, personel istihdamı, eğitim ve kariyer gelişiminde kadınsı değerleri ön plana çıkaran düzenlemeler yapılması önerilmektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Yönetim, Kadınsı Değerler, Erkeksi Değerler, Liderlik Davranışları.

Makale Türü: Araştırma

Introduction

As a discipline, management is an organized accumulation of knowledge, culture and values. Management is not independent from culture and values, whereas managers shape culture and society. Management as a system of cultures, values and beliefs makes the values and beliefs of the society fertile; it is the bridge between a rapidly developing civilization around the world and a culture expressing different traditions, values, beliefs and heritage. Management should be a tool of cultural diversity that serves the common purposes of humanity; since it is not within the boundaries of a single national culture, law or sovereignty, it is multinational. In fact, management is becoming an institution of the world economy (Drucker, 1986, s. 5).

Values influence the actions of the workforce and play a major role in daily decision making, norms and relationships and how people interact with each other in an organization (Rokeach, 1973). According to Henderson and Thomson (2003), values are the DNA of an organization's culture and embedded codes that reflect what happened and why. Values help bring out the best we can and contribute to creating high performance and high satisfaction in business and in life (Izzo and Withers, 2007). Therefore, values are seen as unique human resource capabilities that can create competitive advantage (Paine & Organ, 2000).

Qualities such as empathy, cooperation, conscience, reliability, patience and honesty, which are generally specific to women and highlight feminine values in leadership and organizational management create the expectation that feminine values will shape düthe future. Studies reveal that the behaviors of female leaders are more important and feminine values shape future management in performance and sustainability, which are important criteria in organizational management (Rosener, 1995; McKinsey, 2008; Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013).

Purpose of the Study

The study is based on the assumption and belief that feminine values will shape future management and happier and more successful management is possible and it can be achieved through feminine values, as proposed by some researchers. The main purpose of the research is to determine the values in an effective management from the perspective of the managers and to search the similarity of these values with feminine values. The ultimate goal is to determine the relationship of effective management with feminine values, to reveal the place of feminine values in the management of the future, regardless of the gender of the management. In the article the existence and importance of feminine values in organizational management is investigated through following research questions:

1) What are the prominent management values in an effective organization?

2) Are the values that are embedded in an effective management feminine or masculine?

3) How is the approach of a successful leader towards his/her subordinates?

4) Which values are an obstacle to success?

5) What are the consequences of lack or absence of values?

Another goal of the research is to reveal the important codes of the effective management model and to make suggestions for effective organizational management. The research, which focuses on explaining the management understanding and management practices stated in the vision, mission and

values of businesses, has the potential to give important messages to practitioners in terms of ideal management approaches.

Limitations of the Study

The research is limited to data obtained from the managers of leading companies (BIST 100 companies) in Turkey and also to the time and focusing that participants devoted to questions. The distance from the participants is another limitation.

1. Literature and Conceptual Framework

1.1. A Brief History of Management

An important study on management and organizations was Machiavelli (1469-1527)'s work "Prince" in 16th century which has an important place in the management literature. The understanding of sovereignty and nation-oriented modern state and the political power of human societies were explained by Machiavelli, who is considered the founder of modern politics. Machiavelli, a political theorist, writer and states man, has been a guide on how to obtain and use power (Machiavelli, 2008).

Without an institution or a business enterprise, there would be no management. Before industrial revolution, there was hardly any managerial practice in the form of planning, organizing, coordination, controlling and rewarding duties except somekind of institutions such as church, military and agricultural enterprises based on slave labor. The first examples of management activity were presented by Adam Smith (1723-1790), David Ricardo (1772-1823), Karl Marx (1818-1883) and John Stuart Mill (1806-1873) in the form of increasing productivity through division of labor. According to them there was an objective economy instead of management. An objective economy means that economics deals with the behavior of commodities rather than with the behavior of men and men can only adapt. Man can at best, optimize what the economy makes possible; at worst, he impedes the forces of the economy and wastes resources.

The British classical economist Alfred Marshall (1842-1924) added management to the factors of production, land, labor and capital. J. B. Say (1767-1832) proposed the approach that puts the manager at the center of the economy. Say defined entrepreneurs who direct resources from less productive to more productive investments and thus create wealth. He was followed by French socialists François Fourier (1772-1837) and Comte de Saint-Simon (1760-1825). At that time there were no large organizations and no managers, but both Fourier and Saint-Simon anticipated developments and discovered management before it actually came into being. In Saint-Simon's definitions, the importance of the organization, the ability of organizations to make resources productive and to build social structures, and managerial duties are included.

Management is a discipline that is composed of managerial duties and people. All management activities leading to effective performance are the achievement of managers and all management failures are the failure of managers. The vision, dedication, and integrity of managers determine whether there is perfect management or missed management (Drucker, 1986, s. 6).

The term of management was in wide use in early 1900 and Smith's ideas came into light by Frederick Winslow Taylor, Frank and Lillian Gilbreth, Herbert R. Townes, and Henry L. Gantt. They developed theories that emphasized efficiency, lack of variation, consistency of production, and predictability. The goal was to optimize the outputs that could be generated from a specific set of inputs. Management as a discipline developed in the United States with Frank Gilbreth (1868-1924), Lillian Gilbreth (1878-1972) and Henry Gantt (1861-1919). In England, Ian Hamilton (1853-1947), evaluating his experiences as a military leader during World War I, realized the need to balance the official structure and the policies that gave the organization "spirit"(McGrath, 2014, s. 3).

Later on, two American scientists Mary Parker Follett (1868-1933) and Chester Barnard (1886-1961) examined the decision-making process in organizations, the relationships between public and private organizations, and the role and function of the executive. Follett defines management as the art of getting people to do business and states that it is an organization that includes universal principles beyond competition and profit making (Follett, 1941: xviii-xxiii). Cyril Burt (1883-1972) in England and an Australian Elton Mayo (1880-1949) working at Harvard developed psychology and human relations approaches in the field of industry, respectively, and applied them to businesses and

management activities. The first scientific courses on management were given at Harvard Business School for production management and at Massachusetts Institute of Technology for advanced management work (Drucker, 1986, s. 23).

American James McKinsey (1889-1937) and English Lyndall F. Urwick (1891-1983) moved management beyond technical issues to management consulting and dealt with key management issues such as business policy and management organization. Urwick has classified and codified studies on the structure of management and the function of executives. Austrian Peter Ferdinand Drucker (1909-2005) was the leader in the development of management education. He invented the concept known as management by goals objectives and self-control, and he was known as "the founder of modern management" (McGrath, 2014, s. 4).

Briefly, the evolution of management trends in organizations has undergone a change from the concepts of growth and productivity in the 1800's to management in principles in the 1990's and to the management of meanings in the 2000's (Henderson & Thomson, 2003). Justice and business ethics in the 1990's, animal rights, sustainability and inheritance concerns for future generations in the 2000's reflect these changes. Thus, there have been changes in managerial values such as the balance of work and family instead of strict work ethics; happiness instead of loyalty, empowering staff rather than authority; flexibility instead of hierarchy, creativity instead of imitating; lifelong learning instead of learning to win. Today people look for structures and values that they can identify with, become a part of, make them feel better and make them happy (Elkington, 1997, s. 317-320).

1.2 Expectations from Today's Management

Today's business people act with low awareness of the purpose and effect of the business, incurring costs that cause harmful and undesirable consequences. Enterprises whose purpose is to make profit and which see the system as profit maximization in the short and long term, "use" the system and all its stakeholders for this purpose. Although this approach seems successful in creating material welfare in the short term, it seems impossible to bear and meet the social costs that occur in the long term (Mackey & Sisodia, 2013, s. 55).

Today, business managers often do not care about the harmfull effects they cause on the nature, other creatures in the universe, wildlife and animals, which is vital for the system around them. They continue to follow their own interests, regardless of the negative effects of their actions on the physical and mental health of the team members and customers in the form of stressful and unsatisfactory working conditions, unhealthy products offered to the market and other unethical business practices. In the meantime, businesses associate these negative effects with the external factors beyond themselves. All these indicate that the erosion of the reputation of nation-states and businesses continue to be come increasingly greedy, selfish, exploitative, and unreliable (Mackey & Sisodia, 2013, s. 37). At the root of these lie the ambition to achieve success, wealth, high welfare through increasingly brutal competition at the national and international level. Businesses naturally aim to be successful, earn profits, survive, and be prosperous; however, by following the effective management values and principles in this process, negative effects on the environment can be prevented.

Society members see that the business and organizational structures shaped by capitalism damage the social fabric instead of creating benefit, and create emotionless and unhappy people. Individuals in societies want to get rid of this complex structure and to make a collective transition to a world where happiness, love, justice, peace, prosperity, money and meaning prevail (Mackey & Sisodia, 2013, s. 263. In this context, determining the values that can abolish the negativities caused by businesses will be meaningful in terms of messages to be given to business managements.

1.3 Effective Management

In economic conditions efficiency in management means doing better what is already being done and focusing on costs. But the optimizing should focus on effectiveness that focuses on opportunities to produce revenue, to create markets, and to change the economic characteristics of existing products fend markets. Effectiveness is the foundation of success and doing the right things; efficiency, on the other hand, is a minimum condition for survival after success has been achieved and doing things right (Drucker, 1986, s. 36).

Parsons has defined effective systems in four universal contexts as integration with the environment, setting and achieving goals, coordination of activities and integration of activities. Furthermore, general values ranked very high as functioning of the system in the "internal environment" such as capacity to influence others through expressive communication may be a highly strategic factor (Parsons, 2014, s. 410-412). According to Simon (1997, s. 359-360), performance effectiveness depends on the effectiveness of the game and the effectiveness of game tools; the effectiveness of the administrative process will vary according to the effectiveness of the organization and the effectiveness of its members playing their roles.

Managerial effectiveness depends on the relative evaluation of different criteria categories (Freeman 1984), creating added value in a holistic sense or preventing the decline of values in the economic, social and ecosystem (Rühli & Sauter-Sachs, 1993, s. 309). Based on these definitions, effective management can be defined as the process of achieving organizational goals without harming all stakeholders and the ecosystem.

1.4 Values in Organizational Management

We use terms such as integrity, freedom, security and private sphere in daily life; friendship, trust, loyalty, affection, sharing etc in social and cultural environment; efficiency, productivity, fairness, flexibility, success, loyalty, order etc in the business environment. These terms represent our values in simplest form. Every individual and every organization has a system of values. Values are the sum of our preferences and priorities. Preferences are what we want to have in our lives whereas priorities are how important each choice is compared to the other (Henderson & Thomson, 2003).

Rokeach (1973) defines a value as a permanent belief that is personally or socially-preferred. Therefore, it can be stated that values exist at the individual, organizational or social level. At the individual or organizational level, values are guiding standardized behaviors. Values have a judgmental aspect that expresses what is right, good or desirable as ways of thinking and behaving. This nature of values leads to the argument that what is right for one person or group may not be right for another. The values or preferences and priorities may change over time for different reasons. Managers can teach and convey information about values to employees to ensure efficiency and competence.

There exists a tremendous body of research concerning the place of values in management. These are given below:

- Leadership and management activities are shaped on the basis of values (Clonninger, 2009; Kouzes & Posner, 2007),

- Organizational identity is linked to the development of personal moral value (Hailey, 2000; Urde, 2001; Klenke, 2005),

- Values lead the way (Fichter, 2006, s. 175); They characterize people and events, determine and legitimize their beliefs and behavior patterns (Schwartz, 1992, s. 1),

- Values are necessary for the interpretation of communication and messages in management (Montgomery, 2004, s. 351).

There is a distinct transformation process between the individual and organizational values. When individual values are successfully applied by a few people in an organization, these values turn into common beliefs that should be present in the organization (Schein, 1992, s. 19). This transformation is shaped by social experiences that groups constantly test, approve or abandon.

Values of persons and organizations are generalized by ideological justifications for appropriate behaviors and activities as functions of the system (Chatman, 1989); suitability for individual roles (Brudney et al., 2000); principles contributing to workplace culture (Schein, 1992); organizational qualities that provide organizational purpose and intangible characteristics (Bolman & Deal, 2008); Values have been expressed in various ways, such as the set of basic principles supporting the organization's vision (Senge, 1990).

Kanter et al. (2015) explains the values that integrate with corporate goals and principles and manage change in today's contemporary organizations as follows:

1) Intuitive decision-making power;

2) The motivational power that activates positive feelings;

3) An organizational control power based on entrepreneurial self-organization, self-management and equal value arrangements;

4) An organizational identity that encourages a longer-term perspective and broadens the coverage of the firm;

5) Creating an ecosystem.

1.5 Values in Society

Social order emerges with the formation of communication and common expectations, people learn how to act through socialization and roles (Slattery, 2003, s. 335). In every social order, there are socio-cultural values that distinguish men and women from each other and define, direct, shape and control their roles, and individuals are expected to act in accordance with these values. The values stereotyped by the social order for men are called masculine, and the values stereotyped for women are called feminine (Oakley, 2016). Geert Hofstede (1980) described the feminine and masculine values in gender roles in his research through IBM company from different parts of the world and on the employees of more than 70 countries between 1960-1970.

According to Hofstede et. al. (2010, s. 137-138), biological constraints of men and women determine their social roles in a society. The behavior patterns deemed appropriate for women and men differ from one society to another, whether they are masculine or feminine. A man can behave in a "feminine" way and a woman in a "masculine" way; this situation is outside of stereotyped social expectations.

In today's world, oppression, control, competition, aggression, discrimination, limitation of freedoms oftenly leads to wars, income inequality, taking wrong risks and scandals. A world dominated by masculine thoughts and behaviors at the universal level seems to have disappointed not only men and women but also all people in general. Humanity needs a new structuring; If the driving force of invention and discovery is needs, today humanity needs new management values. In a global study by Gerzema & D'Antonio (2013), this truth emerges from the stories of people struggling with economic distress, rapidly changing technology and social problems all over the world.

1.6 Feminine and MasculineValues at Social, Organizational and Individual Levels

Feminine and masculine values are established norms at the individual, organizational and social levels. Feminine social cultures are open to creating equality between gender roles, men and women share duties in every setting, have the same responsibilities in working and earning money for the family, and can show the similar feelings. Showing weakness is not perceived as unfavorableness and quality of life is the most important value at the social level. On the other hand, a different value system prevails in the masculine social cultures. Gender roles, ideals, and male and female relations are separated in masculine social cultures. Men are the breadwinners and decision makers of the family, they have to present strong, dominant and tough images, they are not allowed to show emotions by crying; women are expected to serve the household, raise children and obey their husbands (Hofstede et al., 2010, s. 155).

According to Hofstede, male societies differ in the relationships, gender roles and expectations for men and women; men who provide all the material conditions for the family must present a strong, dominant, and sometimes harsh image; men make decisions but are not allowed to cry and show their feelings. Of course, what is expected from a woman is exactly the opposite; like taking good care of the household, raising children and, of course, obeying her husband.

In contrast, feminine societies are more open to creating equality between gender roles: men and women share all the tasks around the house, have the same responsibilities for the family and earning, they can show the same emotions, showing weakness is natural in social context and is not condemned, and quality of life is the most important. At the organizational level feminine values at the organizational level express strong relationships between subordinates and superiors, cooperation-

oriented work, comfortable living space, work safety and continuity whereas masculine values express earning and high income, fame, appreciation, promotion, satisfaction with motivating and ambition. So, characteristics of feminine values seem to represent high stability and characteristics of masculine values seem to represent ambition to gain at the organizational level (Hofstede et al., 2010, s. 139-155).

The feminine and masculine value dimensions summarized by Hofstede's research at IBM are known as cultural values that organize social structures. Although the research was conducted between 1960 and 1970 and was limited to IBM employees, it bears similarities with the feminine and masculine values revealed by today's research. Hofstede's masculine and feminine categories seem to be in line with the source that Gerzema and D'Antonio describe as the virtues of the goddess Athena and that feminine values are on the rise at a global level (Komar, 2016, s. 181).

Gerzema and D'Antonio argue that although today's social structures seem like a male-dominated world, they actually show signs of female domination. The authors' research findings on the current situation point to a strong change for future, revealing that both women and men will have predominantly feminine values in public space or power settings. This worldwide study, which characterizes individual behaviors as feminine and masculine, has described what it means to be feminine or masculine as stated below (Gerzema & D'Antonio 2013, s. 9-10):

●Feminine values: free, attractive, reliable, reasonable, determined, creative, flexible, intuitive, social, honest, teamplayer, collaborative, supportive, gentle, emotional, creative, open, loyal, devoted, patient, encouraging, etc.

● Masculine values: dominant, strong, arrogant, proud, ambitious, determined, logical, aggressive, competitive, stubborn, direct, selfish, restrained, competent, etc.

People seem tired of living in a world dominated by thoughts and behaviors that represent traditionally masculine values; that codes of control, competition, aggression and discriminatory and contributing to problems. They think that wars, income inequality, injustice, reckless risk taking and scandals threaten the continuity of life (Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013, s. vii).

1.7 Mary Parker Follett and Invisible Leadership

Michael E. Porter & Claas van der Linde (1995, s. 133) suggest that top management executives should spend less time on resisting new environmental legislation, and more rethinking on the nature and future of their businesses to ensure they are well prepared for sustainability. Management has to perform to manage productivity of work, achievement of worker and social impacts and social responsibilities (Drucker, 1986, s. 547). This indicates that management is a challengıng work that necessitates leadership and leadership in turn is the lifting of a man's vision to higher sights, higher performance, higher standard, and building personality beyond its normal limitations. Through leadership, human strengths are made effective, a drastic shift from personnel management to the leadership of people by sharing responsibilities, power, motivation, participation, satisfaction, incentives, rewards, status, and function. In exerting leadership, the managers of the various institutions undertake social responsibility, think through values, beliefs, the commitments of their society, and assume leadership responsibility beyond the discharge of the specific and limited mission of their institutions. According to Elkington (1997, s. 155) organizational values are essential to wealth creation and must be central to sustainability. While many values are shared in cultures around the world, the sustainable development community must learn to recognize and work with diversity in values. These are the views that have been perfectly expressed by Mary Parker Follett nearly a hundred years ago.

One hundred years ago, Mary Parker Follett (1868-1933) focused on concepts such as participatory management, democracy, expertise and power. Today's stakeholder theory, corporate social responsibility, empowerment of staff, participatory and sharing management philosophy which all are associated with Follett's works lays the foundation of the participatory and sharing management philosophies (Newman & Guy, 1998). The dominance of the male-dominated structure in the world of science as well as in every field caused Follet to be ignored. Yet Follett is almost today's social scientist and management theorist; she is an important science woman focused on the integration of the individual and the organization with an idealistic and philosophical approach (Morse, 2006).

The importance of Follett's contributions to management science has recently been understood, and some comments on the subject are given below:

● Follett has seen and explained that the basic function of the job is to allow individual development and that this is possible with structures that organize human relations that contribute to material and spiritual values. (Graham, 1995; Sapru, 2006).

● When Follett asserted in 1918 that motivation was essential for true professional management, she saw that work encompasses corporate responsibility beyond just a producing business (Graham, 1995).

● Follett was an advocate of humanity in the field of organizational relations and corporate social responsibility, and her ideas shed light on the current stakeholder theory. For Follett, the integrative process is at the heart of the conflict resolution process, and negotiations provide the method of problem solving. She defends both the creative and integrative power of pluralism and diversity, and the concept of "power together" based on participation and sharing also reflects the feminist perspective (Whipps, 2014).

It should be said that Mary Parker Follet's views on leadership break newground in modern leadership theories, because she has given to leaders the responsibility of intuition and foresight in the practice of division of labor as associating them with the situation law. Thus, the leader should understand the general situation, develop common goals, and be able to predict the next situation. Due to the mobility of time and the uncertainty of the situation, the next situation contains uncertainties, and each situation requires re-evaluation with its own characteristics. Both leaders and followers should act in line with a common goal (Monin & Bathurst, 2008, s. 447-448).

A good leader must make followers realize the strength they have, how to apply it and how to develop it. The leaders ensure that the followers take part in the leadership activity, for this they should ensure that the followers use their power and integration capacity effectively together, participate in coordination with confidence and belief, and take on the responsibilities required by the situation. The essence of Follett's idea of leadership is that the leader creates a vision that the audience will follow, and she defines it as the "invisible leader" (Follett, 1949; Follett, 1941, s. 288) which also parallels with the liberal leader.

1.8 Feminine and Masculine Leadership Models in Management

Leaders behave within the constraints of gender roles and socially shared expectations that apply to certain social categories (Biddle, 1979; Sarbin and Allen, 1968). Gender roles are the generalized qualities of women and men in the society and, consequently, feminine and masculine values. Thus, gender roles affect leader behaviors and women and men in the same leadership positions display different behaviors that comply with the expectations of gender (Gutek & Morasch, 1982; Gutek, 2001; Kanter, 2008). Gender roles generalized in organizations shape the latent identity of the organization in the background, with these different leadership behaviors of women and men (Ridgeway, 2001, s. 644).

A meta-analysis, which is based on the leadership definitions of researchers such as Eagly et al., (2003), Lewin (1947), Likert (1961), Tannenbaum & Schmidt (1973), Vroom & Yetton (1973), Blake & Mouton (1978), Fiedler (1978), Hersey et al. (2008) compared the leadership styles of women and man and explained values of leadership related to gender. Meta-analysis results show that feminine leadership styles are democratic, relationship-oriented and transformational; masculine leadership styles are authoritarian, task-oriented, and transaction-oriented.

Similar results have been found in other studies on leadership styles related to gender. The research results of Daft (2005, s. 438) show that women are more willing to establish relationships, to be inclusive, to be participatory and affectionate, to share power and knowledge, to encourage employee development, and to make efforts to develop individuals' sense of self-worth. Sherman's (2000, s. 138) study, which examines the leadership experiences of female administrators in rural schools, also shows feminine values such as mother, motherhood, giving peace, affectionate and empathy in parallel with Daft's research results; explains nurturing, collaborative, connecting, and relationship-oriented

leadership styles. The studies of Bennett (1997) and Ramsay (2000) also revealed similar results confirming that women are more democratic and participatory than men.

All of the afore mentioned studies indicate that feminine leadership styles and feminine values are on the rise in societies and organizations, and that a silent management revolution is taking place that builds the management model of the future. Indeed, there is a great need for feminine efforts to increase social welfare, improve economy and technology, reduce poverty, improve education, health and immigrant problems, and consequently create sustainable production, consumption, environmental climate and a greener world in our time (OECD, 2008, s. 3). It is the transformational and community-oriented leadership characteristics that will open the doors to a better world, and these characteristics are abundantly present in female leaders (Bagilhole & White, 2008; Berkery et al., 2013).

1.9 Leadership and Feminine Values in Organizational Management

Management is the leading, directing and decision-making body in social organizations, especially in businesses; it is a general function in every nation and society with the same basic tasks. Therefore, it is out of question to see leadership as independent from management. More and more leadership is sought in the top management of the organizations for the quality of social life. Today, the leadership power, knowledge, visions and responsibilities determine the development of societies, the wealth of aristocrats, big land owners, and even capitalists. So tasks, responsibilites and practices of managers is the central field of study as a need, as an essential contribution, and as a subject of study and knowledge in an organizations' top management (Drucker, 1986, s. 13).

There are various studies indicating that feminine values are on the rise in the top management of organizations (Loden, 1985; Helgesen, 1990; Rosener, 1995). Leadership behaviors of the 21st century stand out as:

• Transparent, democratic, participative, teamwork oriented (West, 2012; Arnold & Loughlin 2013; Peterson, 2018),

• Collaborative, client and relationship-oriented mentoring (Eagly & Carli, 2007; Gaucher et al., 2011; Loughlin et al., 2012; Madsen, 2012; Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013; Katila & Eriksson, 2013; Varje et al., 2013; O'Connor & Göransson, 2015) and away from masculine and autocratic values.

Although masculine values such as dominant, strong, arrogant, proud, ambitious, determined, logical, aggressive, competitive, stubborn, direct, selfish, restrained, competent are important in terms of contingency, other values defined as contemporary are sought in the managers of our age. Contemporary management values are defined by the feminine qualities as advisee, relationship-oriented, friendly, patient, democratic, being far from hierarchy, participation in decision making and supportive behavior (Eagly & Carli, 2007; Gaucher et al., 2011; Loughlin et al., 2012; Madsen, 2012; Arnold & Loughlin 2013; Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013; Katila & Eriksson, 2013; Varje et al., 2013; O'Connor & Göransson, 2015; Peterson, 2018). Today, organizational structures dominated by traditional vertical relations are far from offering interaction, discussion, compromise and collective solutions to the problems encountered (Porter-O'Grady, 2003).

1.10 Leadership and Thinking Like a Woman

Today, although the styles of female leaders are more compatible with contemporary characteristics, the majority of leaders are male and this situation is caused by gender beliefs and prejudices shaped by the perception that men are suitable to be leader (Eagly & Carli, 2007, s. 102). With a similar point of view, Powell (2012, s. 134) confirms the perception that good managers are men, however, he states that the cliches formed by this perception are in a change and the degree of describing good managers mainly in terms of masculine values is in the process of decline.

Leaders whose origins lie in the depths of the past, in times that feminine qualities reign are still the best leaders who are not extinct. The essence of contemporary leadership has evolved to represent feminine qualities, and people now want leaders who internalize the qualities attributed to women, such as extroversion, sharing, affectionate, resilience, and empathy. These extraordinary leaders can be both men and women, and these innovative leaders break away from traditional, masculine structures and lead a world that embraces society, is interconnected and transparent (Gerzema, 2013a). In this context,

feminine values are more suitable for contemporary management and modern businesses than masculine values (Różycka, 2018, s. 34).

Thinking like a woman has no resemblance to the aggression and self-centered leadership styles displayed by men; rather, it is to be democratic, participatory, collaborative, encouraging, promoting and problem solver (Eagly & Carli, 2007, s. 74). Traits such as determination and resilience exhibited by men are valuable, but feminine qualities that represent flexibility and cooperation associated with emotional intelligence appear to be critical for building consensus and eliminating problems. It is essential that leaders of the future to work horizontally away from hierarchy and together with the workforce for power, produce results that benefit everyone, create solutions that strengthen the economy without sacrificing families and communities, see differences as a power, and possess characteristics that transform peace, justice and human rights in an effort to build everyone's future (Tar-Whelan, 2009, s. 78).

Emphasizing the importance of transformative leadership style, Tar-Whelan (2009, s. 73-75) describes today's female leaders with the following characteristics:

• Building the future on long-term plans instead of managing crises with daily solutions;

• To create a life that integrates work, society, family and friendships in common goals and values;

• Creating shared value and consensus for all stakeholders;

• Focus on egalitarian and horizontal relationships that foster innovation; sustainability and self-sufficiency.

There is an increasing trend for patient, utilitarian and long-term thinkers who have the capacity to divert and transform the experiences of the past into great bargains and good deeds today. Leaders who recognize and implement this orientation are those who build better businesses, institutions and communities that achieve strong performance and goals, and these leaders see and adopt feminine values as an evolving innovative method and strategic advantage that provides integrity (Thar-Whelan, 2009, s. xvi). Because the change of strategies, product portfolios, structures, processes and business models do not cause problems for today's modern businesses that have managed to integrate employees with their organization and corporate identity, they can maintain their business direction, provide innovation, have access to new resources and new partnerships, sustainability and self-sufficiency (Kanter et al., 2015, s. 18).

The Athena doctrine explains that feminine values are preferred in leadership, ethics, success and happiness in societies and that the future is woman. This global research includes sixty-fourthousand people choices that defines feminine leadership as a smart and silent power, and this power has the following characteristics (Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013, s. 21-22):

● Being connected: the ability to create and maintain networking relationships,

● Humility: A lifestyle that allows listening, learning from others and sharing,

● Sincerity: Being willing to speak openly and honestly,

● Patience: Accepting that some solutions emerge slowly and over time,

● Empathy: Sensitivity to understand others,

● Reliability: Character strength that increases trust,

● Openness: Being open to all people and concepts,

● Flexibility: The ability to change and adapt when circumstances require,

●Being vulnerable: The courage to admit that human beings can make mistakes due to their nature,

● Balance: To have a versatile sense of purpose.

These features both arouse admiration as today's virtues and reflect a noble character power. Frankness, flexibility, humility and balance require integration and trust; being both vulnerable and in connection with others requires courage (Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013, s. 22).

Today's prominent leaders see vulnerability as a strength rather than a weakness, knowing that failure in the history of every successful business story impacts success as a driving force. For these leaders, vulnerability and consequential failure are as natural as success. Leaders who unwaveringly put forth weak conditions are more likely to trigger the idea of a breakthrough while saving time and money. In the struggle to overcome weak conditions, leaders will encourage their followers to share information, knowing and confronting vulnerabilities and weaknesses, will be able to identify the obstacles they face, discover faster and more efficient solutions to overcome these obstacles, and gain social benefits from success. Accepting vulnerability and weaknesses will help to find solutions to problems with a participatory and sharing approach, to discover new ways, to reach top benefits with effective and efficient solutions, and to save time and money (Gerzema, 2013a). Leaders who learn from failures and adopt a participatory approach seem to be more likely to internalize feminine values more.

Thinking like a woman means acting in a more democratic and participatory manner than male leaders. Women tend to be more democratic and relationship-oriented because of their social nature, such as worrying about others, being generous, sensitive, understanding and affectionate (Cuadrado et al., 2012, s. 3086).

Thinking like a woman is also being more sensitive and active than male leaders in revealing problems that benefit society (Bear et al., 2010; Boulouta, 2013; Larkin et al., 2013; Post et al., 2011). And thinking like a woman is to be more sensitive to corporate social responsibility (Bear et al., 2010; Post et al., 2011). It is possible to reach new markets or opportunities, to create and expand the social resource base, to create a new corporate responsibility and collaborative infrastructure, with an open, honest and collaborative leadership approach that is aware of strengths and limits, and modest without arrogance (Kanter et al., 2015, s. 18). And such a ladership approach can be expected to have internalized the feminine values more.

1.11 Evolution to Feminine Society

In today's world, oppression, control, competition, aggression, discrimination and limitation of freedoms oftenly lead to wars, income inequality, taking wrong risks and scandals we face. Since a world dominated by masculine thoughts and behaviors at the universal level seems to have disappointed generally all people, humanity needs a new structuring; the driving force of invention and discovery being the needs, today humanity needs new management values. In a global study by Gerzema and D'Antonio (2013), this truth emerges from the stories of people struggling with economic distress, rapidly changing technology and social problems all over the world.

American corporate executives make their decisions about managing, developing, prioritizing, and determining the future of the companies give precedence to earning profitable returns for the shareholders. It is noteworthy that at least 33% of those who manage wealth of Fortune 500 companies are women managers. In the absence of female contributions such as diversity of ideas, solution methods, leadership and business approaches, it is predicted that alternative ways of doing business would not be considered and outdated methods would prevent the possibility of opening up to different alternatives (Tarr-Whelan, 2009, s. 4-11).

The search for effectiveness in the control of strategic and operational activities onboards of directors of companies increases the interest in female managers whereas women managers create awareness and become successful with their ability to reduce conflicts and bring efficiency to board activities. Rising feminine values in organizations and social life carry management research to a new level (Nielson & Huse, 2010). Both in company management and in social life, women struggle to create a common future in solidarity with men, by using their feminine abilities rather than reaching equal conditions with men. This struggle carries out a more feminine world that benefits everyone, a revolution in which feminine values are on the rise (Bolen, 2013). Thus, these developments unfold an evolution from a patriarchal management to a management dominated by feminine values (Gerzema & D'Antonio 2013, s. 21). And it can be stated that at the first stage of this evolution, intellectual movements such as

feminism, human rights, equality, pluralist understanding and sexual preferences first paved the way for gender equality and then laid the groundwork for change in the social order.

2. Methodology

2.1 Participants and Method of the Research

The research has qualitative design and data are gathered by documents and interviews. In the document analysis, vision, mission and values definitions were retrieved from the BIST 100 companies[3] websites and values that companies attach importance to have been evaluated by content analysis. Afterwards, data from managers were collected through the interview forms. The collected data express gender values and leadership characteristics adopted and applied by managers. Descriptive statistics and

Masculine Values	Feminine Values
Dominant, Aggressive, Strong, Hard, Authoritarian, Direct, Understandable, Reckless, Brave, Daring, Fearless, Charismatic, Strong, Powerful, Consensual, Natural leader, Provocative, Ambitious, Decisive, Competitive, Disciplined, Logical, Analytical, Competent, Objective, Rational, Independent, Confident, Assertive, Progressive, Distinctive, Innovative, Dynamic, Tough, Result-based, Determiner, Career Focused, Cool, Durable, Consistent, Persistent, Resisting, Sedulous, Challenging	Loving-affectionate, Balanced, Creative, Open to new ideas, Good listener, Flexible, Team player, Community Oriented, Friendly, Supportive, Inclusive, Encouraging, Patient, Passive, Dependent-connected, Renunciant, Understanding, Trustworthy, Dedicated-self sacrificing, Benevolent, Social, Heartfelt, Sincere, Conscientious, Merciful, Imaginative, Humble, Honest, Nurturing, Sensitive, Emotional, Impressive, Clear-easily understandable, Empathetic, Socially responsible
Masculine Leadership Styles	**Feminine Leadership Styles**
Authoritarian	Democratic
Task oriented	Relationship oriented
Transaction oriented	Transformational

content analysis were performed on the data. Table 1 below shows the gender values and leadership styles detected in the research.

Table 1. Gender Values and Leadership Styles

Source: Peterson, (2018); Eagly et al., (2003); Daft, (2005).

Gender values definitions in Table 1 are retrieved from Peterson (2018) analysis whereas Peterson' work on the feminine and masculine values are based on the research of Collinson & Hearn (1994), Allan et al., (2006), Gaucher et al., (2011), Loughlin et al. (2012), Gerzema & D'Antonio, (2013), Katila & Eriksson, (2013), Varje et al. (2013).

The masculine and feminine leadership styles in the table, are based on studies of Eagly et al., (2003). Also the research findings of Daft (2005) provides an important contribution in terms of confirming the content of feminine values in leadership.

The first part of the interview form included questions to collect data on the behavior of the leader towards her/his subordinates. Questions were prepared in relation with the research of Eagly et. al., (2003) and the managers were asked to select the behavior styles they defined for themselves. At the second part of the interview form, managers were asked to select the values that should be in an effective business management. In addition, managers were determined by the tasks and culturally conditioned and subjected to the values, the traditions, the habits of a given society asked in which time period the values they adopted as effective management values emerged. In the last part of the interview, in the open-ended questions managers were asked to describe their experiences in management.

The reasons for choosing the BIST 100 index companies for the research have three folds; Firstly, they are institutionalized structures and secondly, these corporate structures posses common values about management being an objective function, determined by the tasks and culturally conditioned and subjected to the values, traditions and habits of a given society that are universally shared. BIST 100 index companies' perspective on keeping up with the world economic system and making it sustainable is the third reason. These features can bring businesses in the BIST 100 index to a position that create profound impact on the society and country's economy in terms of investment, business volume and employment.

[3]BIST 100: Are the top companies in the İstanbul stock exchange in terms of shares trading volume

The official websites of all BIST 100 businesses were accessed at www.kap.gov.tr, and the vision, mission and values of 100 enterprises were searched. These statements are available for 81 businesses and not for others, so 81 businesses were found eligible to provide data. The data obtained from the specified number of BIST enterprises constituted the secondary data of the research.

The data obtained from the interview forms consisting of the responses from 38 managers of 20 BIST 100 companies -two of which are central managers and 18 branch and regional managers constituted the primary data of the study. 27 of the 38 interviews were conducted face-to-face and 11 of them were conducted via the internet method. Primary data collection was completed on January 25, 2020. The interviews were conducted with 15 female managers and 23 male managers.

3. Results

3.1 Content Analysis of the Secondary Data

In May 2019, the vision, mission and values definitions of 81 businesses were obtained from the official websites of the companies and these were first entered into the MS Word file. All recorded data, which we can be called as the database of content analysis, consists of a total of 53 pages and 13 thousand 498 words. The word frequency is given in Table 2 by counting how many times BIST 100 businesses repeat each of the feminine (n = 33) and masculine (n = 44) values in the vision, mission and values definitions.

Table 2. Content Analysis of the Web Data

Feminine Values	Word Count	Masculine Values	Word Count
Creative	109	Strong	80
Trustworthy	83	Innovative	61
Community oriented	54	Result based	30
Understanding	35	Competitive	18
Sensitive	31	Determiner	13
Honest	30	Authoritarian	9
Clear, easily understandable	25	Progressive	6
Dependent, Connected	23	Dynamic	6
Social	21	Consistent	6
Supportive	18	Disciplined	5
Team player	15	Powerful	4
Friendly	11	Decisive	4
Impressive	10	Career focused	3
Inclusive	10	Understandable	2
Balanced	10	Objective	2
Socially responsible	9	Tough	2
Flexible	6	Sedilous	1
Benevolent	6	Assertive	1
Sincere	5	Independent	1
Loving, affectionate	3	Rational	1
Open to new ideas	2	Analytical	1
Good listener	2	Ambitious	1
Encouraging	2		
Renunciant	2		
Dedicated, Self-sacrificing	1		
Humble	1		
TOTAL	524	TOTAL	257

As seen in Table 2, the frequency of repetition of feminine values was found as n = 524 and the frequency of repetition of masculine values as n = 257. In feminine values, the word Creative 109 times,

the word Trustworthy 83 times were repeated and in masculine values the word Strong 80 times, and the word Innovative 61 times were repeated.

Feminine values not mentioned are Patient, Passive, Merciful, Imaginative, Nurturing, Emotional, Empathetic; and masculine values not mentioned are Dominant, Aggressive, Tough, Authoritarian, Direct, Reckless, Brave, Daring, Fearless, Charismatic, Powerful, Natural leader, Consensual, Provocative, Logical, Confident, Distinctive, Cool, Durable, Persistent, Resisting and Challenging. It is observed that BİST 100 companies adopt and prioritize feminine values more than masculine values in their vision, mission and values definitions.

3.2 Content Analysis of the Primary Data

For the leadership behavior analysis chosen by the participants, firstly the definitions in the literature are grouped according to their content. The grouping sex plain masculine leadership behaviors and feminine leadership behaviors and Mary Parker Follett's liberal and invisible leadership behaviors given by Table 3.

MASCULINE LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOR		Women	Men	TOTAL	FEMININE LEADERSHIP BEHAVIOR		Women	Men	TOTAL
AUTHORITARIAN	Keeping employees out of decisions	1	1		DEMOCRATIC	Ensuring employees participate in decisions	14	23	37
	Keeping information monopolized					Sharing information with others	10	20	30
TASK ORIENTED	Applying stress and pressure in tasks	1		1	RELATIONSHIP ORIENTED	Harmonious and good relationships	14	23	37
	Leaders set goals and manage performance	3	1	4		Employees generally participate in processes	15	22	37
TRANSACTION ORIENTED	Focus on business practices		1	1	TRANSFORMATIONAL	Ensuring interests are aligned with organizational interests	9	12	21
	The rewards changes according to the situation	10	21	31		Supporting employees	15	21	36
	Correction of mistakes is aimed	1	1	2		Providing opportunities for employees to improve	14	23	37
TOTAL		**15**	**25**	**40**	**TOTAL**		**91**	**144**	**235**
FOLLETT									
LIBERAL LEADERSHIP		Stayingback, standing out if necessary					7	18	25
INVISIBLE LEADERSHIP		Freeing subordinates in decision making, implementation and control, only to be consulted					3	7	10
TOTAL							**10**	**25**	**35**

Table 3. Masculine and Feminine Leadership Behaviors

Results of the analysis are as follows:

• Frequency of masculine and feminine leader behaviors adopted by men and women managers is shown separately in Table 3. Masculine leadership behaviors were preferred 40 times whereas feminine leadership behaviors were preferred 235 times and leadership behaviors of Follett were preferred 35 times. More specifically, masculine leadership behaviors were preferred 15 times by women and 25 times by men. It is seen that female leadership behaviors were preferred 91 times by

women participants and 144 times by men participants. Findings in this part of the interview reveal that men and women participants adopt female leadership behaviors. Participants preferred Follett's liberal leadership behaviors 25 times and invisible leadership behaviors 10 times.

• The effective management values preferred by the participants are divided into feminine and masculine groups at the analysis stage and indicated as traits in the Table 4 below.

Table 4. Feminine and MasculineTraits Defining Effective Management Traits

FEMININE TRAITS	No	MASCULINE TRAITS	No
Open to new ideas	36	Confident	34
Encouraging	35	Sedulous	30
Trustworthy	35	Innovative	30
Team player	35	Powerful	29
Creative	34	Dynamic	29
Supportive	34	Result based	29
Balanced	33	Consensual	28
Honest	33	Disciplined	28
Empathetic	33	Objective	27
Goodlistener	32	Competitive	27
Patient	30	Brave	26
Social	30	Understandable	25
Heartfelt	30	Durable	25
Understanding	27	Strong	24
Renunciant	26	Decisive	24
Clear, easily understandable	25	Competent	23
Socially responsible	25	Assertive	23
Sensitive	23	Cool	23
Impressive	22	Analytical	22
Conscientious, merciful	22	Logical	21
Community Oriented	21	Natural Leader	19
Humble	21	Consistent	19
Imaginative	20	Determiner	18
Loving, affectionate	20	Progressive	18
Flexible	19	Charismatic	17
Inclusive	18	Ambitious	17
Benevolent	18	Career focused	17
Nurturing	15	Strong	14
Friendly	15	Rational	14
Dedicated, self-sacrificing	12	Distinctive	14
Emotional	11	Dominant	11
Dependent, connected	3	Direct	11
Passive	1	Fearless	10
		Independent	10
		Resisting	10
		Persistent	9
		Authoritarian	8
		Challenging	7
		Daring	4
		Tough	2
		Hard	1
		Aggressive	
		Reckless	
		Provocative	
TOTAL	794	TOTAL	777

The frequency of preferred feminine traits is n = 794, masculine traits is n = 777 in the table. In feminine traits Openness to New Ideas 36 times, Encouraging 35 times, Reassuring 35 times, Honest and Empathetic 33 times were preferred and participants made choices in all feminine traits. The least preferred traits were Passive 1 time, Dependent 3 times and Emotional 11 times. In masculine traits Confident 34 times, Sedulous 30 times, Innovative 30 times, Result based 29 times, Dynamic 29 times, Powerful 29 times were preferred and Aggressive, Reckless, Provocative were not preferred at all. The

least preferred traits were Hard 1 time, Tough 2 times, Daring 4 times, Challenging 7 times and Persistent 9 times.

The findings in this part of the analysis indicate that men and women participants adopt feminine values, but the difference in the preference frequency of feminine and masculine values was lower compared to the previous sections of the analysis. For example, high-ranking feminine values such as Creative, Trustworthy and Community Oriented in the secondary data of the websites defined as vision, mission and values by BIST 100 companies are two to three times the primary data values. This indicates that BIST 100 companies adopt feminine values with a large numerical difference in their vision, mission and values; BIST 100 company managers prefer feminine leader behaviors with a large difference in their leadership behaviors in practice, and they prefer feminine traits, although their effective management features are lower than those stated on the companies' websites.

Comparison of the findings obtained from the primary and secondary data of feminine and masculine values will be meaningful in terms of revealing at what level the preferences in the vision, mission and values of BIST 100 companies are internalized by the managers in practice.

• Frequency analyses were made on the data obtained from the answers given to the question about the time frame for values. The results are given by Table 5.

Table 5. Values Time Frame

TIME PERIOD OF VALUES	n	%
Since establishment	9	23,7
Inthe last decade	16	42,1
In the last five years	9	23,7
In the last year	4	10,5
TOTAL	**38**	**100**

According to the participants; n = 16 (42.1%) stated that values emerged in the last ten years, n = 9 (23.7%) stated that values emerged since the establishment, n = 9 (23.7%) stated that values emerged in the last five years and n = 4 (10.5%) stated that values emerged in the last year.

Table 6. Change of Effective Management Values

CHANGE OF EFFECTIVE MANAGEMENT VALUES	n	%
Changed	31	81,6
Not changed	7	18,4
TOTAL	**38**	**100**

In the questıon about the change in effective management values, n = 31 (81.6%) participants stated that effective management values changed and n = 7 (18.4%) participants stated that effective management values did not change as indicated by Table 6.

Table 7. Comparison of Changes in Effective Management Values by Gender

SCALE VALUE	CHANGE OF EFFECTIVE MANAGEMENT VALUES	GENDER				TOTAL	
		Women		Men			
		n	%	n	%	n	%
1	Changed	12	31,6	19	50	31	81,6
2	Not changed	3	7,9	4	10,5	7	18,4
	TOTAL	**15**	**39,5**	**23**	**60,5**	**38**	**100**

According to Table 7, n = 12 (31.6%) women managers and n = 19 (50%) men managers stated that effective management values changed whereas n = 3 (7.9%) women managers and n = 4 (10.5%) men managers stated that effective management values did not change.

As a result, the majority of the participants' opinions in the research show that effective management values have emerged in the last ten years; values have undergone a change and the majority of men and women managers confirm this change.

• In the answers given by the participants to open-ended questions, the word numbers of feminine and masculine values are given below.

1. In the values you adopt as effective management values

a. Has there been a change?

b. If there has been a change, in what direction has it changed?

c. If there has been no change, should there be? Why is that?

Table 8.

Feminine Values	7
Masculine Values	7

Participants repeated both feminine and masculine values n = 7 times for their explanations about change as seen Table 8. Participants emphasized feminine values such as Emotional, Understanding, Teamplayer, Flexible and Impressive, and masculine values such as Result-based, Innovative, Dominant, Disciplined, Decisive, Brave and Analytical in their explanations.

Seven participants answered "no" and 31 participants answered "yes" to the question 1(a). Participants who answered "no" did not answer the 1c, except for one person, and one participant replied "It can be, people develop, they can add to their values by their experiences ". On the other hand, 31 participants who answered "yes" answered the questions with feminine and masculine values and various themes. Participants repeated both feminine and masculine values 7 times for their explanations about change as seen Table 8. In their explanations about the direction and necessity of change, the participants emphasized feminine values such as Emotional, Understanding, Team player, Flexible and Impressive, and masculine values such as Result-oriented, Innovative, Dominant, Disciplined, Determined, Brave and Analytical.

2. Does your business have effective management values in practice? Why is that?

Table 9.

Feminine Values	7
Masculine Values	6

All of the participants confirmed that their businesses have effective management values. As can be seen from the Table 9, in the responses of the participants, feminine values n =7 times and masculine values n = 6 times were mentioned.

Participants emphasized feminine values such as Understanding, Renunciant, Benevolent, Passive, Friendly, Teamplayer and Trustworthy and masculine values such as Innovative, Competent and Competitive in their explanations. Participants put forward the reasons for their companies to have effective management values as the institutional structure of their companies, being contemporary, giving importance to values, being open to change and being liberal.

3. What values do you think will come to the fore in future business management? Why is that?

Table 10.

Feminine Values	19
Masculine Values	23

As can be seen from Table 10, participants expressed their views on values in future business management and their reasons. In their views about the future, they emphasized masculine values such as increasing and destructive Competitive, Ambitious, Result-based, Innovative, Confident, Assertive, Independent, Consensual, Consistent, Analytical, Authoritarian and Independent at a higher level as n = 23 times. Participants emphasized feminine values such as Social, Empathetic, Creative, Balanced, Patient, Team player, Honest, Community-oriented, Inclusive (Integrative), Emotional, Flexible and Socially responsible in their views on the future business management as n = 19 times.

4. What are the values that ensure employee happiness? Explain the reasons.

Table 11.

Feminine Values	40
Masculine Values	11

Table 11 indicates that the participants expressed the values that ensure employee happiness mainly in terms of feminine values. The main feminine values used by the participants in their answers are Social, Supportive, Benevolent, Empathetic, Humble, Goodlistener, Trustworthy, Teamplayer, Emotional, Nurturing, Loving, Impressive, Encouraging and Friendly; masculine values are Career-based, Consensual, Disciplined, Understandable, Confident, Competitive and Dynamic. In explaining the reasons for the values that ensure employee happiness, they expressed a motivational, participatory and sharing understanding which makes the employees happy.

5. a. What do you think about the personal values that prevent success in business life?

Tablo 12.

Feminine Values	4
Masculine Values	14

Table 12 shows the personal values of the participants that prevent success in business. Participants repeated feminine values n = 4 times such as Passivity, High emotionality and Dependent and masculine values n = 14 times such as Cool, Dominant, Hard, Authoritarian, Provocative, Overly Ambitious and Provocative in their explanations. It is seen that predominantly masculine values were expressed as hindering success. Participants perceived high Emotionality (n = 2) and excessive Ambition (n = 6) as obstacles to success. So it is accepted that participants confirmed average levels of emotionality and ambition as essential for personal success. Selfishness, Ego and Arrogance, which participants perceive as personal values that hinder success, are masculine values that contain negativity in the literature. So these values are not included in research in order to maintain the objectivity of the research and stay within the limits of the predetermined conceptual framework.

b. What values should a person have for personal success?

Tablo 13.

FeminineValues	59
MasculineValues	62

Table 13 shows the values that should be possessed for personal success. In total participants reported the feminine values for personal success n = 59 times and the masculine values n = 62 times in their answers. Most repeated feminine values are Patient, Empathetic, Team Player, Honest, Humble, Open to new ideas, Social, Good listener, Trustworthy, Emotional and most repeated masculine values are Ambitious, Sedulous, Innovative, Disciplined, Decisive, Confident, Analytical, Career Focused.

6. a. Which values are lacking in organizational management pose an obstacle to achieving organizational success?

Tablo 14.

Feminine Values	66
Masculine Values	43

As seen in Table 14, participants mentioned the absence of feminine values more than masculine values as the obstacle to achieving organizational success. Following definitions are the obstacles to success according to the participants:

Abandoning all approaches that value people, overly repressive management, too frequent orientation, the problem of authority and the related lack of responsibility, disloyalty, selfishness and not being person and relationship orientedness, the management's willingness to make decisions alone, working individually, restricting individual preferences, or not giving initiative to the employee, arrogance, pride, selfishness, cumbersome, overly bureaucratic and one-man management, procedures focusing only on business interests, not considering the employee and the customer, unfair distribution of income.

b. Write down the reasons.

Participants explained the reasons for the obstacles to achieving organizational success as follows:

The abandonment of approaches that value people will reflect negativity for all stakeholders in the long run; it will prevent business and environment integration; there will be no organizational commitment; it will prevent organizing and seeing the big picture; it will create incompatibility for justice and for business to work; It will awaken the idea that employees can not get a reward for their good performance, it will lead to an organization that does not go after the same goal, stay away from changing trends and it will prevent the focusing for success.

Participants totally expressed feminine values are n = 202 times and masculine values are n = 166 times in their responses to open-ended questions given by Table 8, Table 9, Table 10, Table 11, Table 12, Table 13.

Discussion

In discussion for the results, considering the number of emphasis on the basis of the answers given;

-The number of emphasis on masculine values compared to feminine values is slightly higher in terms of the future expectations of the participants,

- As far as the values that ensure employee happiness are concerned, the number of emphasizing feminine values compared to masculine values in is quite high,

- In questions about success, masculine values were emphasized more for personal success and feminine values were emphasized more for organizational success.

The review of the open-ended questions indicates that feminine values were emphasized more than masculine values in total. Feminine values in terms of organizational success and employee happiness; masculine values for future expectations and personal success come to the forefront.

When the results of the analysis are evaluated in general, it is observed that in the management values of BIST 100 companies;

- Feminine values are stated more than masculine values,

- Managers adopt female leadership behaviors more than masculine leadership behaviors,

- Feminine values are preferred more than masculine values for effective management characteristics,

- Effective management values emerged in the 5-10 years period,

- Feminine values are expressed more in organizational success and happiness expectations whereas masculine values are expressed more in personal success and future expectations.

In summary, the analysis results reveal that an effective management carries feminine values to a large extent, feminine leadership behaviors are preferred, effective management values change over time, and preferences for organizational success and happiness are concentrated on feminine values from the perspective of BIST 100 managers.

Conclusion and Recommendations

The results of the qualitative research conducted on BIST 100 companies in Turkey to examine the place of the feminine values in organizational management are given below:

1. The values defined as creative, open to new ideas, social and relationship-oriented etc. which are"feminine" and shaped by the active relations between the two hemispheres of the human brain, come to the fore in BIST 100 companies. Results are concordant with the works of Rosener (1995), McKinsey (2008), Gerzema & D'Antonio (2013) and Peterson (2018) and proved that feminine values are prominent in organizational management.

2. Participants mainly exhibited feminine leadership behaviors, Follett's invisible leadership style and transformational leadership behaviors. This result is consistent with the literature and the expectations that the future is woman (Eagly & Carli, 2007; Gaucher et al., 2011; Loughlin et al., 2012; Madsen, 2012; Arnold & Loughlin 2013; Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013; Katila & Eriksson, 2013; Varje et al., 2013; O'Connor & Göransson, 2015; Peterson, 2018).

3. In the answers given to open-ended questions about success, feminine values are emphasized more often than masculine values. This result indicates that feminine values are more preferred as a success criterion in the management of BIST 100 companies.

4. In the open-ended question about the successful leader's behavior style the happiness variable was examined, because it was revealed by a meta-analysis study that individuals with higher happiness levels were more successful. Meta-analysis shows that happiness is not only achieved as a result of success, but is also associated with successful results and even precedes them; evidence supports that the individual's well-being provides happiness and this may be the reason for success (Lyubomirsky et al., 2005, s. 803). From this point of view, it is thought that associating the question of 'What are the values that ensure employee happiness?' will make the values that ensure success more understandable. Participants emphasized feminine values almost four times the masculine values in their answer to the question of happiness.

5. When the questions of success and happiness are evaluated together, it is found that feminine values are emphasized more than masculine values. The results reveal that feminine values come to the fore in the approach of the successful leader towards her/his subordinates. In other words, the participants of the research give precedence to feminine leadership behaviors. The findings show that feminine values are preferred in terms of success, leadership approach and happiness. This result supports the research findings of Daft (2005).

To sum up, the existence of values in management ensures integration and continuity, whereas the absence of values causes problems and failure by disrupting management activities. These findings revealed the importance of values in management and the feminine values are the preferred ones in organizational management.

Contribution of the Research Findings to Practice

Following are the contribution of the research findings to the practice of management:

• The most important contribution of the research in terms of management practice is that it explains the values in business management structures and the reflections of these values in management practice. The second important aspect of the research is that the company executives, while presenting their personal opinions, described the ideal management which can carry the world of the 21st century to a better, more progressive platform in terms of feminine values. Thus, clues about the values that make management successful through the values put forward by the managers who adopt sustainability and efficiency as a principle and try to reach this structure have been reached in the research. These results are in agreement with the studies that reveal the behaviors of female leaders are important and feminine values are expected to shape the future management in performance and sustainability, which both are important criteria in effective organizational management (Rosener, 1995; Mc Kinsey, 2008; Gerzema & D'Antonio, 2013). The feminine leadership behaviors and feminine values as mentioned in this research are expected to be a guide for practitioners. In this way, it might be possible to contribute to the formation of a more humane and happy business life through adopting the management style and values that ensure success.

• The management views and practices stated in the vision, mission and values of the companies provide important data for the practitioners. The research findings explain the values and principles envisaged, applied and longed for in business management; draws attention to the codes of an effective management model; thus, it is evaluated that some convincing messages to business management and society might be conveyed.

• The research is thought to be important in terms of showing that the perceptions of men and masculine behavior are not at the center of the world and the management, and that women and feminine values also exist in the world and in the management. Whatever the game is played on the management today, this consciousness is as certain and clear as Copernicus' discovery that the world is not the center of the universe (Lerner, 1986, s. 13). This precise and clear consciousness can decisively achieve the desired and expected transformation in management.

• Throughout the history up until our time, there have been women who did not obey the unequal and unfair practices of the male-dominated patriarchal system, by first overcoming the barriers of the glassceiling and surviving the glasscliff through making patriarchal bargains with the system. These women demonstrated their talents and showed that feminine values are effective and strong in management, creating the expectation that the future is woman. It has been stated that women exhibit feminine values more often than men, they can be much more effective as change agents that challenge dominant codes imposed and generally encourage the spread of the effective leadership (McKinsey, 2008, s. 15). It seems possible that a world full of peace, prosperity, happiness, justice, love and affection might come into existence sooner with managers who have more feminine values at the head of businesses, governments and other institutions. It is expected that the leadership model built upon feminine values might enable the world to survive better than greedy, selfish, exploitative and unreliable strategies.

• Feminine leadership in management should not be perceived as a shift of power and control from men to women; It is simply about achieving a balance between strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and threats through unconditional love, creativity, dedication, supportivity, sensitivity and freedom for humanity. Through such a balance, it might be possible to open the doors to a better world.

Contribution of the Research Findings to Literature

The basic contribution of the research findings to literature is to propose an effective organizational management model built upon feminine values. In this respect, following can be stated:

• Findings primarily established the relationship between values in effective management and feminine values from the perspectives of business managers.

• Findings examined the role of feminine values in management of today and the future, regardless of the gender.

• Suggestions for woman leadership. Research findings are expected to open the way for woman leadership by highlighting feminine values in management. All over the world, business and administrative management is under the autonomy of men. In organizations, the policy of "recruiting suitable man" is believed to be neutrality and it is accepted that the business world is the world of "men". On the other hand, some men opposing power and violence, try to develop closer emotional relations with children and women, despite the privileges that the patriarchal structure gives them, and make equality efforts by thinking that the privileges they hold unfairly are unethical (Sancar, 2009, s. 273-275). It is extremely important that these efforts become widespread in both public and private spheres. The types of afore mentioned messages for male-dominated societies and organizations to pave the way for female leaders and highlight feminine values are:

• Supporting feminism, feminine future and working for gender equality is for the benefit of men. While male supremacy provides power and status, there are burdens and costs paid, so men's self-interest might be better served by supporting feminism and female leadership.

• Men should give priority to the development of anti-patriarchal ideas that eliminate the problems of opposing emancipatory interests and encouraging masculine domination. Men who are against sexist discrimination should see the real face of the patriarchal structures and invite others to see it.

In today's business world, we can see women displaying masculine values in order to have a say in management and protect their positions, and at the same time trying to protect their female identity. In other words female managers tend to be more masculine in appearance and style as they compete with their male counterparts in business life; they emphasize their feminine values in their expectations, they exhibit their reactions to social and environmental issues. It is observed that female managers adopt styles of seemingly authoritarian masculine structure in their leadership which they combine masculine and feminine values whereas they exhibit feminine values in communication and social relations (Staub, 2017, s. 217). This ambivalent behavior may be a form of bargaining with the patriarchal system surrounding women. However, organizations can take some measures that open the way for women leaders to bring feminine values to the forefront in practice.

• According to Kanter (2008, s. 442) the number of women in organizations being equal to men eliminates the disadvantageous position for women. In Finland, women are employed in superior numbers in the government cabinet and they promise stability and confidence (www.skdturkiye.org). Considering these issues and rising feminine values in management, it should be ensured that women have higher numbers of posts in the upper, middle and lower management positions of all organizations. Thus, the harmful effects of the patriarchal system might decrease and an equitable and free governance structure of feminine values might emerge. In this context, positive discrimination for women should be implemented as an organization policy, and the states should legally guarantee the implementation of this policy. It is also important to ensure that feminine values are emphasized in the recruitment, placement, training and career advancement of the personnel in organizations.

Academic Recommendations

It is expected that the research can be a guide for future academic studies. In this regard, some suggestions have been developed as given below.

The existence and level of adoption of feminine values in organizational management can be investigated in the context of national and global activities of multinational companies. Thus, the existence and level of adoption of feminine values in the parent and subsidiary companies can provide important clues in terms of the effect of the organizational culture on business policies.

A study can be conducted to reveal the differences between the sectors in terms of the adoption of the feminine values in business life; such a study can have important contributions to gaining insight into the perspective of managers in different sectors.

The results of the research raise the following question: "If feminine leadership behaviors and feminine values were dominant in handling past problems in the economic, social and political environments, whether and how different would be the recent economic, social and political outlook in today's world? The results of such a query can be expected to contribute to the solutions of managerial dilemma in our time.

References

Arnold, K. A. & Loughlin, C. (2013). Integrating Transformational and Participative Versus Directive Leadership Theories, Leadership and Organization Development Journal, 34(1), 67-84.

Allan, E., Gordon, S. & Iverson, S. (2006). Re/Thinking Practices Of Power: The Discursive Framing Of Leadership İn The Chronicle Of Higher Education. The Review of Higher Education, 30(1), 41-68.

Bagilhole, B. & White, K. (2008). Towards a Gendered Skills Analysis of Senior Management Positions in UK And Australian Universities, Tertiary Education and Management, 14(1), 1–12.

Bear, S., Rahman, N. & Post, C. (2010). The Impact of Board Diversity and Gender Composition on Corporate Social Responsibility and Firm Reputation, Journal of Business Ethics, 97(2), 207-221.

Bennett, R. (1997). Organisational Behaviour, Prentice Hall, Harlow.

Berkery, E., Morley, M. & Tiernan, S. (2013). Beyond Gender Role Stereotypes and Requisite Managerial Characteristics: From Communal to Androgynous, the Changing Views of Women, Gender in Management, 28(5), 278–298.

Biddle, B. J. (1979). Role Theory: Expectancies, Identities, and Behaviors, Academic Press, Newyork.

Blake, R. R. & Mouton, J. S. (1978). Toward a General Theory of Consultation, The Personnel and Guidance Journal, 56(6), 328-330.

Bolman, L. G. & Deal, T. E. (2008). Reframing Organizations: Artistry, Choice and Leadership, Jossey Bass, San Francisco.

Bolen, J. S. (2013). Moving Toward the Millionth Circle: Energizing the Global Women's Movement, Conari Press, Newburyport.

Boulouta, I. (2013). Hidden Connections: The Link Between Board Gender Diversity and Corporate Social Performance, Journal of Business Ethics, 113(2), 185-197.

Brudney, J. L., Hebert, F. T. & Wright, D. S. (2000). From Organizational Values to Organizational Roles: Examining Representative Bureaucracy in State Administration, Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, 10(3), 491–512.

Chatman, J. A. (1989). Improving Interactional Organizational Research: A Model of Person-Organization Fit, Academy of Management Review, 14(3), 333-349.

Collinson, D. & Hearn, J. (1994). Naming Men as Men: Implications for Work, Organization and Management. Gender Work Organ, 1(1), 2–22.

Clonninger, K. (2009). Refounding a Movement: Preparing a One-Hundred-Year-Old Organization for the Future, In F. Hesselbein ve M. Goldsmith (Eds.), The Organization of the Future 2 (203-216), Jossey Bass, San Francisco.

Cuadrado, I., Navas, M., Molero, F., Ferrer, E. & Morales, J. F. (2012). Gender Differences in Leadership Styles as a Function of Leader and Subordinates' Sex And Type of Organization: Gender Differences in Leadership Styles, Journal of Applied Socia Psychology, 42(12), 3083-3113.

Daft, R. L.2005. The Leadership Experience, Mason, Ohio.

Drucker P. F. (1986). Management Tasks, Responsibilities, Practices, Truman Talley Books, Newyork.

Eagly, A.H. & Carli, L. L. (2007). Through the Labyrinth: The Truth About How Women Become Leaders, Harvard Business School Press, Boston.

Eagly, A. H., Johannesen-Schmidt, M. C. & van Engen, M. L. (2003). Transformational, Transactional, and Laissez-Faire Leadership Styles: A Meta-Analysis Comparing Women and Men. Psychological Bulletin, 129(4), 569-591.

Elkington, J. (1997). Cannibals With Forks the Triple Bottom Line of 21st Century. Oxford Center: Capstone Publishing Ltd., Oxford.

Fichter, J. (2006), Sosyoloji nedir, Anı Yayıncılık, Ankara.

Fiedler, F. E. (1978). The Contingency Model and the Dynamics of the Leadership Process, In Advances in Experimental Social Psychology, 11, 59-112.

Follett, M. P. (1941). Dynamic Administration: The Collected Papers of Mary Parker Follett, Routledge, Taylor and Francis Group, Newyork.

Follett, M. P. (1949). Freedom and Coordination: Lectures in Business Organization, Management Publications Trust Limited, Newyork.

Freeman, R. E. (1984). Strategic Management: A Stakeholder Approach, MA: Pitman, Boston.

Gaucher, D., Friesen, J. & Kay, A.C. (2011). Evidence That Gendered Wording in Job Advertisement Sexists and Sustains Gender Inequality, Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 101(1), 109-128.

Gerzema, J. & D'Antonio, M. (2013). The Athena How Women and the Men (Who Think Like Them) will Rule the Future, Jossey Bass, San Francisco.

Gerzema J. (2013a). Competency Feminine, Athena Doctrine, It Represents the best in All of Us, Leadership Excellence, April, 19.

Graham, P. (1995). Mary Parker Follett: Prophet of Management, MA: Harvard Business School Press, Boston.

Gutek, B. A. (2001). Women and Paidwork, Psychology of Women Quarterly, 25(4), 379–393.

Gutek, B. A. & Morasch, B. (1982). Sex-Ratios, Sex-Role Spillover, and Sexual Harassment of Women at Work, Journal of Social Issues, 38(4), 55–74.

Hailey, J. (2000). Indicators of Identity: Ngos and the Strategic İmperative of Assessing Core Values, Development in Practice, 10(3-4), 402-407.

Helgesen, S. (1990). The Female Advantage: Women's Ways of Leadership, Doubleday, Newyork.

Henderson, M. & Thomson, D. (2003). Values at Work: The Invisible Threads Between People, Performance and Profit, Harper Collins Publishers, Auckland.

Hersey, P., Blanchard, K. H. & Johnson, D. E. (2008), Management of Organizational Behaviour: Leading Human Resources, Upper Saddle River, NJ, Prentice Hall.

Hofstede, G. (1980). Culture and Organizations, International Studies of Management and Organization, 10(4), 15-41.

Hofstede G., Hofstede J. G. & Minkov M., (2010). Cultures and Organizations, Software of the Mind, McGraw Hill, Newyork.

Izzo, J. B. & Withers, P. (2007). Values Shifts: Recruiting, Retaining, and Engaging Multigenerational Work Force, Fair Winds Press, Lions Bay BC.

Kanter, R. M. (2008). Men and Women of the Corporation, Basic Books, Newyork.

Kanter, R. M., Bird, M., Bernstein, E. S. & Raffaelli, R. (2015). How Leaders Use Values-Based Guidance Systems to Create Dynamic Capabilities, The Oxford Handbook of Dynamic Capabilities, Oxford.

Katila, S. & Eriksson, P. (2013). He is a Firm, Strong-Minded and Empowering Leader, But is She? Gendered Positioning of Female and Male CEOs, Gender Work Organisation, 20(1), 71-84.

Klenke, K. (2005). Corporate Values as Multi-Level, Multi-Domain Antecedents of Leader Behaviours, International Journal of Manpower, 26(1), 50-66.

Komar, Z. (2016). Feminine Rhetoric: Feminine and Masculine Dimensions in the Context of Rhetoric, Gender and Social Spheres, Opus et Educatio, 3(2), 178-184.

Kouzes, J. & Posner, B. (2007). The Leadership Challenge, Wiley and Sons, San Francisco.

Larkin, M. B., Bernardi, R. A. & Bosco, S. M. (2013). Does Female Representation on Boards of Directors Associate with Increased Transparency and Ethical Behavior?, Accounting and the Public Interest, 13(1), 132-150.

Lerner, G. (1986). The Creation of Patriarchy, Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Lewin, K. (1947). Frontiers in Group Dynamics: Concept, Method and Reality in Social Science; Social Equilibria and Social Change, Human Relations, 1(1), 5-41.

Likert R. (1961). New Patterns of Management, McGraw Hill, Newyork.

Loden, M. (1985). Feminine Leadership or How to Succeed in Business without being One of the Boys, Times Books, Newyork.

Loughlin, C., Arnold, K. & Crawford, J. B. (2012). Lost Opportunity: Is Transformational Leadership Accurately Recognized and Rewarded in all Managers?, Equality, Diversity and Inclusion, 31(1), 43-64.

Machiavelli, N. (2008). The Prince (Transl: J. B. Atkinson Edition), Hackett Publishing, Cambridge.

Mackey J. & Sisodia R. (2013). Conscious Capitalism: Liberating the Heroic Spirit of Busines, Harvard Business Review Press, Massachusetts Boston.

Madsen, S. (2012). Women and Leadership in Higher Education: Current Realities, Challenges and Future Directions, Advances in Developing Human Resources, 14(131), 131-139.

McGrath, R. G. (2014). Management's Three Eras: A Brief History, Harvard Business Review, 30, 2-4.

Mc Kinsey and Company, (2008). Women Matter 2 Female Leadership, A Competitive Edge for the Future, McKinsey and Company Inc., Fransa.

Monin, N. & Bathurst, R. (2008). Mary Parker Follett on the Leadership of Everyman, Ephemera-theory and Politics in Organization, 8(4), 447-461.

Montgomery, E. (2004). "Tortured Families: A Coordinated Management of Meaning Analysis, Family Process, 43(3), 346-371.

Morse, R. S. (2006). Prophet of Participation: Mary Parker Follett and Public Participation in Public Administration, Administrative Theory and Praxis, 28(1), 1–32.

Newman, M. A. & Guy, M. E. (1998). Taylor's Triangle, Follett's Web, Administrative Theory and Praxis, 20(3), 287-297.

Nielsen, S. & Huse, M. (2010). The Contribution of Women on Boards of Directors: Going Beyond the Surface, Corporate Governance: An International Review, 18(2), 136–148.

Oakley, A. (2016). Sex, Gender and Society, Routledge, London.

O'Connor, P. & Göransson, A. (2015). Constructing or Rejecting the Notion of the Other in University Management: The cases of Ireland and Sweden. Education Management Administration Leadership, 43(2), 323-340.

OECD (2008). *Gender and Sustainable Development*, Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, Paris.

Paine, J. B. & Organ, D. W. (2000). The Cultural Matrix of Organizational Citizenship Behavior: Some Preliminary Conceptual and Empirical Observations, Human Resource Management Review, 10(1), 45-59.

Parsons, T. (2014). Essays in Sociological Theory, The Free Press of Macmillan Publishing Co., Newyork.

Peterson, H. (2018). From Goal-Orientated, Strong and Decisive Leader to Collaborative and Communicative Listener. Gendered shifts in vice-chancellor ideals, 1990-2018, Educational Science, 8(90), 1-17.

Porter, M. & Van der Linde, C. (1995). Green and Competitive: Ending the Stalemate, Harvard Business Review, 73(5), 120–134.

Porter-O'Grady, T. (2003). A Different Age for Leadership, Part 1: New Context, New Content, JONA: The Journal Of Nursing Administration, 33(2), 105-110.

Post, C., Rahman, N. & Rubow, E. (2011). Green Governance: Boards of Directors' Composition and Environmental Corporate Social Responsibility, Business & Society, 50(1), 189-223.

Powell G. N. (2012). Six Ways of Seeing the Elephant: The Intersection Of Sex, Gender and Leadership, Gender in Management: An International Journal, 27(2), 119-141.

Ramsay, E. (2000, October). Women and Leadership in Higher Education: Facing İnternational Challenges and Maximising Opportunities. Key Note Address Delivered at the İnternational Seminar- Asian Women Leaders in Higher Education II: Leadership Competencies to Face the Local-Global Challenges of the 21st Century, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur.

Ridgeway, C. L. (2001). Gender, Status, and Leadership, Journal of Social Issues, 57(4), 637–655.

Rokeach, M. (1973). The Nature of Human Values, Free Press, Newyork.

Rosener, J. B. (1995). America's Competitive Secret: Utilizing Women as a Management Strategy, Oxford University Press, Newyork.

Różycka, M. (2018). The Conditions of Women's Success in the Context of Appreciation of Female Values, Women and Business, 1(4), 28-35.

Rühli, E. & Sauter-Sachs, S. (1993). Towards an Integrated Concept of Management Efficiency. MIR: Management International Review, 295-313.

Sancar, S. (2009). Erkeklik: İmkânsız İktidar Ailede, Piyasada ve Sokakta Erkekler, Metis yayınları, İstanbul.

Sapru, R. K. (2006). Administrative Theories and Management Thought, Prentice Hall of India, New Delhi.

Sarbin, T. R. & Allen, V. L. (1968). Role Theory, In G. Lindzey and E. Aronson (Eds.), Handbook of Social Psychology (2nd ed., Vol. 1, 488–567), Reading, MA, Addison-Wesley.

Schein, E. H. (1992). Organizational Culture and Leadership, Jossey Bass, San Francisco.

Schwartz, Shalom H., (1992). Universals in the Content and Structure of Values: Theoretical Advances and Empirical Tests in 20 Countries, In Advances In Experimental Social Psychology (M. P. Zanna, Ed.; 25,1- 65), Academic Press, San Diego.

Senge, P. (1990). The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of the Learning Organization, Doubleday, Newyork.

Sherman, A. (2000). Women Managing/Managing Women: The Marginalization of Female Leadership in Rural School Settings, Educational Management and Administration, 28(2), 133-143.

Simon, H. (1997). Administrative Behaviour, The Free Press, Newyork.

Slattery, M. (2003). Key Ideas in Sociology, Nelson Thornes Ltd., United Kingdom.

Staub, S. (2017). Türk İş Dünyasında Kadının Liderlik Tarzı ve Kullandıkları Liderlik Dili, Bilgi Ekonomisi ve Yönetimi Dergisi, 2(12), 207-219.

Tannenbaum, R. & Schmidt, W.H. (1973). How to Choose a Leadership Pattern, Harvard Business Review, 51 (3), 162-80.

Tarr-Whelan, L. (2009). Women Lead the Way: Your Guide to Stepping up to Leadership and Changing the World, Berrett-Koehler, San Francisco.

Urde, M. (2001). Core Value-Based Corporate Brand Building, European Journal of Marketing, 37(8), 1017-1040.

Varje, P., Anttila, E. & Väänänen, A. (2013). Emergence of Emotional Management: Changing Manager İdeals in Finnish Job Advertisements From 1949 to 2009. Management & Organizational History, 8(3), 245-261.

Vroom, V. H., Yetton, P. W. (1973). Leadership and Decision-Making, University of Pittsburgh Press, USA.

West, M.A. (2012). Effective Team Work: Practical Lessons From Organizational Research, John Wiley and Sons, West Sussex, UK.

Whipps, J. D. (2014). A Pragmatist Reading of Mary Parker Follett's Integrative Process, Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society, 50(3), 404-424.